

Vitakka, vicāra

Initial application, sustained application
Theme: Thinking, mindfulness and dhyana
An essay by Piya Tan ©2010

1 *Vitakka, vicāra* and dhyana

1.1 CONTEXT AND MEANING. The word *jhāna* (Skt *dhyāna*)¹ can mean either “meditation,”² or, and more commonly, “mental absorption,” in the sense of the mind being fully itself, untouched and undistracted by any physical sensation, so that it is profoundly calm, clear, and blissful. A problem with understanding the first dhyana is that the first two of its component mental factors, called *vitakka, vicāra*, have been differently interpreted by both scholars and meditators. [4]

For our purposes, we shall broadly define *vitakka, vicāra* as follows:

- *vitakka* thought, applied thought; [meditation] (initial) application of mind to object (a mental factor);
- *vicāra* examination, sustained thought, pondering; [meditation] sustained application of the mind to the object (a mental factor).

Vitakka is etymologically related to *takka*, “thought,” and by extension, “logic, reasoning.” As such, several scholars conclude that conceptual thought continues in the first dhyana.³ Some suttas appear to support such a view, since they refer to the second dhyana as the “cessation of wholesome intentions” (*kusala, cetanā*),⁴ and as “noble silence” (*ariya tuṅhī, bhāva*).⁵

1.2 THE FIRST DHYANA AND THE PHYSICAL SENSES. According to the Raho, gata Sutta (S 36.6) and the **Ānanda Sutta 1** (S 36.15), when we are in the first dhyana, we are no longer able to speak.⁶ This would not be the case if the first dhyana were merely a state of calm reflection. In fact, from the **Mahā, parinibbāna Sutta** (D 16), we know that hearing, too, does not arise in a dhyana.

Pukkusa, a follower of Āḷāra Kālāma’s, relates to the Buddha how, once, his (Pukkusa’s) 500 carts do not trouble the meditating Āḷāra Kālāma at all. The Buddha replies that while he is meditating at Atumā, there is a great thunderstorm that kills two brothers and four oxen, attracting a large crowd thereafter, but the Buddha is total unaware of all this while he is meditating.⁷ **The Kathā, vatthu**, too, refutes the view that it is possible to hear any sound during dhyana (Kvu 572).

¹ If this is the first time you are reading on dhyana, stop right here (for the moment), and read Dhyana (SD 8.4) first, and then go on reading this.

² In fact, the general rule is that the verbs *jhāyati* (3rd sg indicative) and other forms, all refer to the *act* of meditating, not necessarily for the attaining of or the abiding in dhyana: “Meditate!” *jhāyatha*, lit “cultivate *jhāna*” (M 1:45, 118; S 4:133, 4:359, 361, 362, 368, 373; A 3:87, 89, 4:139, 392). Syn *bhāvettha* (2nd pl), “cultivate!” On *jhāna* as meaning “meditation,” see Dhyana = SD 8.4 (3.1) * The Buddha discovers dhyana = SD 33.1b (4.4.3).

³ Ott 1912:348; Barnes 1981:257; Stuart-Fox 1989:94; Kalupahana 1992:35; Bucknell 1993:397.

⁴ “Here all these wholesome intentions utterly cease” (*etth’ete kusalā saṅkappā aparisesā nirujjhanti*): **Samaṇa, maṇḍika S** (M 78.13/2:28) = SD 18.9. The cessation of wholesome intentions here refers to the attainment of fruit of arhathood (MA 3:270). Since his moral habits no longer produce karma, they are not reckoned as “neither wholesome nor unwholesome.” On misconception regarding this statement (that arhats have “transcended” ethical morality), see SD 18.9 (3).

⁵ With the cessation of *vitakka, vicāra*, speech cannot occur: **Kolita S** (S 21.1/2:273); cf **Kāma, bhū S** (S 41.6/-4:293 where *vitakka* and *vicāra* are called verbal formation (*vacī, saṅkhāra*), the mental factors responsible for speech. In **Ariya Pariyesanā S** (M 26), the Buddha exhorts the monks when assembled to “either speak on the Dharma or observe the noble silence” (ie either talk Dharma or meditate) (M 26.4/1:161), ie by attending to their basic meditation subject (MA 2:169). See also **Nandaka S** (A 9.4/4:359); **Tha 650, 999**; **ThaA 2:274** (qu M 1:161), but **ThaA 3:102** refers this to 4th dhyana.

⁶ Respectively, S 36.11/4:217 = SD 33.6 & S 36.15/4:220-223.

⁷ D 16.4.26-32/2:130-132 = SD 9.

The Vinaya records a very interesting incident where some monks accused Moggallāna of making a false claim, because he says that while in the “imperturbable concentration” (here, the 4th dhyana) that he hears the sounds of elephants. That the monks have raised such an objection reflects the idea of the impossibility of hearing any sound during dhyana is generally known by the monks. The Buddha, however, exonerates Moggallāna by explaining that it is possible to hear a sound in such a state if the attainment is not wholly pure (*aparissuddha*) (V 3:109). The Commentary explains Moggallāna has not fully overcome the obstruction to dhyana. His attainment is unstable and thus the hearing occurs while he is in between dhyanas. (VA 2:513 f)

In short, neither speech nor sound arises in dhyana. In fact, all the physical sensing are in suspended animation, as it were. For this reason, Brahmavamso says,

while in any *jhāna* it is impossible to experience the body (eg physical pain), hear a sound from outside or produce any thought, not even “good” thoughts. There is just a clear singleness of perception, an experience of non-dualistic bliss which continues unchanging for a very long time. (1999: 44)

1.3 THE SPIRITUAL NATURE OF THE FIRST DHYANAS. The first dhyana is an “unworldly” experience. The **Lokāyatika Brāhmaṇa Sutta** (A 9.38) speaks of a monk’s having attained the first dhyana as having realized the end of the “world,” which the Sutta identifies with the five senses.⁸ Here again, the Sutta famously refers to how dhyana transcends all physical sensations. [1.2]

The Poṭṭhapāda Sutta (D 9) describes a dhyanic experience as being a distinctly “subtle but real” perception (*sukhuma,sacca,saññā*),⁹ an expression which indicates a highly refined perception that differs from the way the ordinary world is perceived. Here “subtle” (*sukhuma*) refers to a purely mental experience, but it is not something constructed by the mind, but a direct feeling of things as they really are.¹⁰

Māra, by arousing sensual pleasures, works through the five senses to preoccupy the mind.¹¹ Since dhyana shuts down the physical senses, Māra is “blind-folded” from us, so that we are beyond his range.¹² Without Māra’s distraction or interference, it is easier for us to direct our energies to attaining various superknowledges, include the direct knowledge of arhathood. As such, the dhyanas are said in the Sandaka Sutta (M 76) to be a “superb distinction” (*uḷāra,visesa*)¹³

1.4 WE MUST MENTALLY PREPARE OURSELVES FOR DHYANA. We need to ask ourselves, says the German scholar monk, Analayo, if we are unfamiliar with dhyanas,

Whether the first absorption is a deep state of concentration, achieved only after a prolonged period of practice and seclusion, or a stage of relaxed happy reflection within easy reach of anyone and without much need for meditative proficiency. (2003:76)

The latter notion is clearly rebutted by dhyana passages and teachings found in the early texts and their commentaries.¹⁴ Such sources tell us of various preparations, such as living a morally virtuous life

⁸ A 9.38.6-7/4:430 = SD 33.15.

⁹ D 9.10/1:182 = SD 7.14. Comy explains “a subtle but real perception,” *sukhuma,sacca,saññā*, as *vivekajehi pīti,sukhehi sampayutta*, “conjoined with zest and joy born of seclusion” (DA 2:372). This is a stock description of the 1st dhyana with the additional phrase, *sukhuma,sacca,saññā*. *Sukhuma*, meaning “subtle,” here refers to the form dhyana, while its opp *oḷārika*, “gross” refers to the consciousness of the sense-world. On the usage of *sacca* here, see Harvey 1995:24 f. On *viveka*, see Gethin 2001:166-168.

¹⁰ Here, *sukhuma* is part of the “totality formula” that characterizes the 5 aggregates (Vbh 1-13; Vism 14.73/450 f; Abhs 6.7): see Dve Khandha S (S 22.48) = SD 17.1a Intro (3.2). See Gethin 1986:40 f; Karunadasa 1967:38f; Boisvert 1995:43-48.

¹¹ See **Māra** = SD 36.3.

¹² See eg **Nivāpa S** (M 25.12/1:159) = SD 61.2 & **Ariya Pariyesanā S** (M 26.34/1:174) = SD 1.11.

¹³ M 76.43/1:521 = SD 35.7.

¹⁴ The Visuddhi,magga, eg, speaks of developing the counterpart sign (Vism 4.31/125 f), and of cultivating dhyana based on the concentration sign gained through breath meditation (Vism 8.213-225/285-287).

that is uncluttered, keeping the mind from bodily distractions, and cultivating various intricate mental skills to inspire the mind into a singularity of calm, clarity and pure bliss.

Most of the textual sources lay out the training for dhyana as if it were easily attained, but we have at least one instance where the Buddha details his own difficulties in striving to attain the first dhyana. The Upakkilesa Sutta (M 128) clearly shows that even the Buddha, despite his childhood experience of the first dhyana, faced great difficulty when he attempted to attain it during his ascetic years.¹⁵

The Upakkilesa Sutta records how, only after having overcome a series of 11 mental impurities, the ascetic Bodhisattva was able to attain the first dhyana. He had to overcome doubt, inattention, sloth and torpor, fear, excitement, inaction, excessive effort, weak effort, longing, perception of diversity, and excessive gazing at forms. Only with their complete removal was he able to attain dhyana.¹⁶ Similarly, the Tapussa Sutta (A 9.41) reports how the Bodhisattva struggles with sensual desires in order to cultivate dhyana.¹⁷

2 *Vitakka, vicāra* as dhyana-factors

2.1 A “THOUGHTLESS” PROCESS. What we have seen thus far clearly shows that the first dhyana is a state of deep mental focus that is well beyond mere reflection and conceptualizing. We can as such safely surmise that, as dhyana-factors (*jhān’āṅga*),¹⁸ initial application (*vitakka*) and sustained application (*vicāra*) are not thinking processes at all.

In normal thinking and speech, *vitakka* refers to when initial thought directs the attention to what is to be thought or said, while *vicāra* keeps the coherence of a sequence of thoughts or words. In such cases, *vitakka* is usually translated as “initial thought” or simply “thinking,” while *vicāra* is rendered as “sustained thought” or “pondering.” In the first dhyana, however, such a process is merely a “thoughtless” intentional directing the attention towards the object of concentration and keeping it there. As such, it is best to translate *vitakka* in meditation context as “initial application,” and *vicāra* as “sustained application.”

2.2 *VITAKKA* AS INTENTION. The Mahā Cattārīsaka Sutta (M 117) lists *vitakka* under its synonyms for supramundane right thought, and one of these synonyms is “application of mind” (*cetaso abhiniropanā*).¹⁹ We should therefore translate *vitakka* in the dhyana context as “initial application.”²⁰

This translation and sense can be applied to the various sutta passages quoted above, where at first sight seem to suggest that conceptual thought continues into the first dhyana, since they speak of the “cessation of wholesome intentions” on attaining the second dhyana, the “noble silence.” Although, in the dhyana context, initial application is different from discursive thought, it is still here an intention, but a very subtle mental activity.

¹⁵ Analayo insightfully comments: “Possibly his ability to enter the first *jhāna* so easily at this particular moment during his early youth was related to *samatha* practice undertaken in a previous life, an ability lost during his adolescence and later sensual indulgence as a young man, so that he had to develop it anew.” (2003: 76 n42). See The Buddha discovers dhyana = SD 33.1b (4.4.1).

¹⁶ M 128.16-32/3:157-162 = SD 5.18. On how the 11 mental impurities are probably a precursor of the 5 hindrances, see SD 5.18 Intro (3).

¹⁷ A 9.41.4/4:439 f = SD 64.16.

¹⁸ On the def of the *dhyana*-factors, see Dhyana = SD 8.4(6).

¹⁹ “Thinking, thought, intention, mental focus, mental fixity, directing of the mind, verbal formation” (*takko vitakko saṅkappo appanā vyappanā cetaso abhiniropanā vacī, saṅkhāro*): M 117.14/3:73 = SD 6.10. Here the factor of intention (*saṅkappa*) is identified with initial application (*vitakka*), that is instrumental in bringing about dhyana by fixing and directing the mind upon its object. For *vicāra* as “verbal formation” (*vacī, saṅkhāra*), see Cūḷa Vedalla S (M 44.15/1:301). “Application of mind” (*cetaso abhiniropanā*) also occurs at Vbh 257 & Vism 142 in a def of *vitakka*.

²⁰ Similar explanations of *vitakka* in contemporary writings can be found in Shwe Zan Aung & Rhys Davids 1915:238 n1; Stcherbatsky 1923:104; CAF Rhys Davids 1974:8 n1; Eden 1984:89; Ledi Sayadaw 1986:52; Ayya Khema 1991:115; Ajhan Chah 1992:53; Cousins 1992:153; Bodhi 1993:82 & 2000:52; Sujiva 1996:10; Goenka 1999:93; Pa Auk Sayadaw 1999:17.

Only in the second dhyana is attained does such a mental activity fully cease, and concentration becomes completely stable. This is affirmed by the joy and zest of the second dhyana being qualified as being “born of samadhi” (*samādhi,jā*) and the expression, “oneness of the mind” (*cetasā ekodi,bhāva*). The mind here has attained total stillness, that is, the noble silence, bereft of even the subtle wholesome intentions. All this shows that dhyans is no ordinary reflection, but arises only after some effort of meditation skill.

3 Dhyanas, four or five?

3.1 A DHYANA WITHOUT VITAKKA. A problem with understanding the first dhyana is that the first two of its component mental factors, called *vitakka,vicāra*, have been differently interpreted by both scholars and meditators. The suttas characterize the 1st dhyana as “with initial application and sustained application) (*sa,vitakka sa,vicāra*).²¹ However, several discourses also mention a dhyana without *vitakka* but with *vicāra*.²² As a result of this, the Abhidhamma speaks of a *fivefold* dhyana system.

In the Ahidhamma model, another dhyana is added in between the first and second described in the suttas, and *vitakka* and *vicāra* are eliminated successively, instead of simultaneously, as in the sutta model. In the sutta tradition, when both *vitakka* and *vicāra* are eliminated, the second dhyana arises with the dhyana-factors of *pīti, sukha* and *ekaggatā* (that is, zest, happiness and one-pointedness). In the Abhidhamma tradition, the elimination of *vitakka* alone produces the second dhyana, thus retaining *four* dhyana-factors (that is, including *vicāra*) (DhsA 43, 179-182).

3.2 BUDDHAGHOSA’S EXPLANATIONS. The fivefold dhyana model is elaborated by Buddhaghosa in the Attha,sālinī, his Dhamma,saṅgaṇī Commentary, DhsA 43, 179-182). He says that this is an optional model, depending on the particular mental disposition of the disciple. For those who, when reviewing the first dhyana, see *vitakka* as the first factor to appear gross, while the other four are subtle, the teacher formulates a second dhyana with four factors [3.1], that is, without *vitakka*, but with *vicāra, pīti, sukha* and *ekaggatā* (DhsA 179).

Buddhaghosa supports his explanation with reference to the suttas themselves, quoting the Saṅkhit-ta Dhamma Sutta (A 8.63), where three kinds of samadhi are listed, namely:

- (1) samadhi with both *vitakka* and *vicāra*;
- (2) samadhi without *vitakka* but with only *vicāra*; and
- (3) samadhi with neither *vitakka* nor *vicāra*. (A 8.63.5/4:300) = SD 46.6

Of these, he says that the second represents Abhidhamma interpretation of the five stages of dhyana.²³

The Sukha Vagga (A 2.7) of the Aṅguttara says that there are two kinds of happiness—the happiness with zest (*sa-p,pītika sukha*) and the happiness without zest (*ni-p,pītika sukha*)—of these two, the latter is the foremost.²⁴ Its Commentary notes that *sappītika* here means “happiness of the first and second dhyana that is attended by zest” (*sa-p,pītikān ti paṭhama,dutiya-j,jhāna,sukham*) and that *nippītika* refers to the “happiness of the third and fourth dhyanas that is bereft of zest” (*ni-p,pītikān ti tatiya,catuttha-j,jhāna,-sukham*) (AA 2:153).

The Sukha Vagga goes on to say that of two further kinds of happiness—that which is delight-based (*sāt’ārammaṇa sukha*) and that which is equanimity-based (*upekkhārammaṇa sukha*)—the foremost is

²¹ See eg *Sāmañña,phala S* (D 2.77/1:74); *Mahā Saccaka S* (M 38.31/1:246); *Jhāna Ābhiññā S* (S 16.9/2:211 f); *Sa,nimitta Vg* (A 2.2.3/1:53).

²² *Avitakka,vicāra,matta. Saṅgīti S* (D 33.1.10(50)/3:219); *Upakkilesa S* (M 128.30/3:162); *Sa,vitakka Sa,-vicāra S* (S 43.3/4:360), *Asaṅkhata S* (S 43.12/4:363); *Saṅkhit-ta Dhamma S* (A 8.63.5/4:300); Dhs 33, 54; Vbh 264, 266, 277-279; Paṭ:VRI 2:91; MA 4:209; DhsA 179; Vism 4.198-202/168-170; Miln 337 calls them “the concentration jewel” (*samādhi ratana*). Stuart-Fox points out that some of the Pali sources quoted above do not have any Chinese version in the Āgamas (1989: 92).

²³ DhsA 179 f; see also MA 4:209.

²⁴ A 2.7.11/1:81 f. See M:H 3:207 nn.

the equanimity-based happiness. Its Commentary says that the former is the happiness of the first three dhyanas, while the latter is that of the fourth dhyana (AA 2:153).

3.3 REPETITION IN THE 2ND DHYANA DEFINITION? The stock definition of the second dhyana runs like this:

With the stilling of initial application and sustained application, by gaining inner tranquillity and oneness of mind, the monk enters and dwells in the second dhyana, free from initial application and sustained application, accompanied by zest and happiness, born of concentration.²⁵

Vitakka, vicārānaṃ vūpasamā ajjhataṃ sampasādanaṃ cetaso ekodi, bhāvaṃ avitakkaṃ avicāraṃ samādhi, jaṃ pīti, sukhaṃ dutiyaṃ jhānaṃ upasampajja viharati.

(D 2.79/1:73, 22.21(viii)(2)/2:314 f; M 27.20/1:181, 141.31/3:252; Vbh 254)

Notice that the underscored phrases are effectively synonymous. The question now is whether they are repetitive and redundant or not. Buddhaghosa, in his *Visuddhi, magga*, explains that each of the two phrases executes a different function. The opening phrase, he says, is mentioned for the following reasons:

- (1) to directly point out that the second dhyana is attained by eliminating the gross factors of the first dhyana;
- (2) to indicate that the cause of serene faith (*sampasādana*) and oneness of mind (*ekodi, bhāva*); and
- (3) to show that the second dhyana is without initial application and sustained application.

(Vism 4:146 f/156)

In short, while the first phrase refers to the condition *leading into* or producing the second dhyana, the second phrase describes the *characteristic condition* of the second dhyana itself.

4 Other characteristics of *vitakka, vicāra*

4.1 *VITAKKA, VICĀRA* AND *PAPAÑCA*. Outside of dhyana, *vitakka* and *vicāra* have closely to do with thinking and pondering, the kind of mentation that tends to implode into a powerful private world in itself. This private world of words, ideas and emotions is known as “mental proliferation” (*papañca*). Two ancient verses from the Sutta, *nipāta* hint at the close relationship between *vitakka* (as thought), *papañca* (mental proliferation), and mental liberation:

7 *Yassa vitakkā vidhūpitā
ajjhataṃ anuvikappitā asesā
so bhikkhu jahāti ora, pāraṃ*²⁶
urago jīṇaṃ iva tacāṃ purānaṃ

Whose thoughts are burnt up,
utterly cut off within,
that monk leaves both this shore and the far shore
as a snake leaves its old worn-out skin. (Sn 7)

8 *Yo nāccasārī na paccasārī*²⁷

Who ponders not what is ahead nor what is past,²⁸

²⁵ *Vitakka, vicārānaṃ vūpasamā ajjhataṃ sampasādanaṃ cetaso ekodi, bhāvaṃ avitakkaṃ avicāraṃ samādhi, jaṃ pīti, sukhaṃ dutiya-j, jhānaṃ*. The 2nd dhyana is known as “the noble silence” (*ariya, tuṇhī, bhāva*) because within it initial application and sustained application (thinking and discursion, *vitakka, vicāra*) cease, and with their cessation, speech cannot occur (S 2:273); cf S 4:293 where *vitakka* and *vicāra* are called verbal formation (*vacī, saṅkhāra*), the mental factors responsible for speech: see Kolita S (S 21.1/2:273 f) & *Dutiya Jhāna S* (S 40.2/4:263 f). In *Ariya, pariyesanā S* (M 1:161), the Buddha exhorts the monks when assembled to “either speak on the Dharma or observe the noble silence” (ie either talk Dharma or meditate).

²⁶ Cp this line with Dh 385. See Dh:G(B)202 f.

²⁷ Comy: “*yo nāccasārī* means ‘who runs not too far ahead’; *na paccasārī* means ‘nor has he been left behind’” (*yo nāccasārī ti yo nātidhāvi, na paccasārī ti na ohiyyi*, SnA 1:21, 14). Comy explains this as meaning that the monk does not resort to extremes in views or in practice (SnA 1:21). Cf *yo nātyasaraṃ ca cātyasaraṃ* (Uv 32.55), but, notes Norman, “Both may, however, be merely reminiscences of the sentiment seen in *oliyanti eke, eke atidhāvanti* (U 72; It 43, 14). See Dh:G(B)201-205 & Norman 1974a:175.

<p><i>sabbam suvikkappitā²⁹ asesā</i> <i>so bhikkhu jahāti ora,pāraṃ</i> <i>urago jīṇaṃ iva tacāṃ purānaṃ</i></p>	<p>well cut off the all without remains, that monk leaves both this shore and the far shore as a snake leaves its old worn-out skin. (Sn 8)</p>
--	---

Sn 7 tells us that one who has “burnt up,” that is, utterly destroyed, all thinking, the source of karma and suffering, is free from rebirth, abandoning suffering as a snake casts off its slough.

Sn 8 is enigmatic and I don’t think anyone has, in recent times, explained it satisfactorily within the early Buddhist context.³⁰ Technically (see footnote at Sn 8a), we can translate the line *yo nāccasārī na paccasārī* as “Who neither transgresses nor causes others to transgress,” but it is rather strained, as it does not fit the rest of the verse.

The verse probably says that the true saint does not get caught up with the past or the future, and he has also given up the present,³¹ that is, the “all” of the sense-faculties.³² As such, the saint is no more reborn.

4.2 CESSATION OF VITAKKA, VICĀRA. In the *Cūḷa Vedalla Sutta* (M 44), the nun Dhamma, dinnā explains to the layman Visākha that *vitakka* and *vicāra* are “speech activity” (*vacī, saṅkhāra*): “For, avuso Visākha, having first applied thought and sustained thought, one then breaks out into speech. Therefore, *vitakka, vicāra* is called speech activity.”³³

She adds that a person who has attained the cessation of perception and feeling,³⁴ speech activity stops first (that is, in the second dhyana, the state of noble silence).³⁵ Then body activity stops (in the fourth dhyana, when the breath process ceases).³⁶ Finally, mind activity stops (that is, a temporary suspension of all mental activity lasting up to a week, even more).

And when the meditator emerges from the cessation of perception and feeling, mind activity restarts first, followed by body activity, and finally speech activity.³⁷ Non-returners and arhats (including the Buddha) who weary at the arising and passing away of conditioned existence would, with the proper technique, often dwell in the state of cessation for durations of seven days or more (Vism 604). This state, as it were, is only a step away from nirvana.³⁸

— — —

²⁸ This is a free contextual tr based on the surmise that *accasārī* and *paccasārī* are derived respectively from *atisarati* and *paṭisarati*, both der from √SMR (to remember) instead of √SR (to flow). Norman suggests a possible reading: *yo n’accasārī na p’accasārī*, “and so obtain an antithesis between the simple verb stem *sar-* and the causative stem *sār-*.” We can then tr it as: “whoever has never transgressed nor even caused to transgress” (1974a:176). See Dh:G(B)204.

²⁹ Here I follow Comy (SnA 1:21) which takes it in the sense of “cut” from Skt √KLP, “to trim, cut”; see also KhpA 1:116,3; J 6:268,27*). For a helpful philological analysis, see Sn:N 134.

³⁰ Sn 8 has a parallel in the Gandhārī Dharmapada (DhG 86), where see John Brough’s extensive and useful philological analysis: Dh:G(B)200-205.

³¹ See **Bhadd’eka,ratta S** (M 131/3:187-189) = SD 8.9.

³² See **Sabba S** (S 35.23/4:15 = SD 7.1).

³³ *Pubbe kho āvuso visākha vitakketvā vicāretvā pacchā vācamā bhindati. Tasmā vitakka, vicārā vacī, saṅkhāro* (M 44.15/1:301) = SD 40a.9. Cf Vism 23.24/703, 23.51/709.

³⁴ *Saññā, vedayita, nirodha* or *nirodha, samāpatti*: It is listed as the 9th or last stage of as the 9 “progressive abidings” (*anupubba, vihāra*), ie the 4 form dhyanas (*rūpa jhāna*), the 4 formless dhyanas (*arūpa jhāna*), and the cessation of perception and feeling (D 3:265, 290; A 4:410). See M 43.25/1:296 & Vism 23.51/709; cf S 22.95/3:143*; Dh 41.

³⁵ S 21.1/2:273 = SD 24.12b.

³⁶ *Raho, gata S* (S 36.11/4:217) = SD 33.6.

³⁷ M 44.19/1:302 = SD 40a.9. See also MA 2:349 & Nyanatiloka, *The Path to Deliverance*, 1982 §§76, 206.

³⁸ On the difference btw cessation and the death state, see M 43.25/1:296 & Vism 23.51/709; cf S 22.95/3:143*; Dh 41.

Bibliography

Please see under Samadhi = SD 33.1a

Reading

- (1) Analayo, *Satipaṭṭhāna: The direct path to realization*, 2003: 75-79.
- (2) Brahmavamso, *Mindfulness, Bliss and Beyond*, 2006:155-166.
- (3) Rupert Gethin, *The Path to Awakening*, 2001:180-183.
- (4) Martin Stuart-Fox, "Jhāna and Buddhist scholasticism," 1989:79-110.

070729; 100513; 100524